



June 15, 2021

Joshua Cunningham
Branch Chief, Advanced Clean Cars
California Air Resources Board
1001 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814

Subject: Public Health Comments on Advanced Clean Cars II Workshop

Dear Mr. Cunningham:

On behalf of the undersigned health and medical organizations, we are writing in response to the Advanced Clean Cars II (ACC II) rulemaking workshop hosted by the California Air Resources Board in May. Our organizations appreciate that CARB is working to advance the next round of vehicle emission and technology standards to reduce harmful air and climate pollution, and are pleased to add to our [prior recommendations on the ACC II rule](#).

Californians face the most difficult air pollution challenges in the United States, and our climate crisis is making the job of protecting and improving public health more difficult. The American Lung Association's [*State of the Air*](#) 2021 report found that seven of the ten most ozone-polluted cities in the nation are in California, as are six of the most polluted by fine particles. Climate change impacts including extreme heat, drought and wildfires add to pollution burdens throughout California, and especially within communities most impacted by transportation pollution. The transportation sector is responsible for 80 percent of ozone-forming emissions and approximately half of greenhouse gas emissions in California. California needs a strong, consistent and holistic approach to cleaning up transportation pollution that includes both shifting to healthier travel modes and rapid deployment of zero-emission technologies.

The ACC II regulations offer a critical opportunity to reduce harmful pollution through the strongest possible standards for controlling pollutants that add to our ozone and particle pollution burdens and our climate crisis. The combined approach of reducing harmful pollution from combustion engines while also accelerating the transition to 100 percent zero emission passenger vehicles by 2035 is a crucial component of CARB's overall approach to controlling transportation pollution. Our comments below are focused on ensuring real-world emission benefits through tighter controls on combustion engines and accelerating real-world deployment of zero-emission vehicles (ZEVs).

Cleaning up the combustion fleet

We strongly support CARB's approach to cleaning up the combustion fleet while the transition to zero-emission technologies occurs. In particular, we comment on the following elements discussed at the May workshop related to stringency of standards and certification processes:

- ***We support the CARB staff proposal to remove ZEVs from the fleet average for ozone-forming pollutants because ZEVs provide essential air pollution reductions that should not be averaged against combustion vehicles.*** We restate our previous support for removing zero-emission vehicles from the fleet average standards for ozone-forming pollutants. This is necessary to ensure that the major reductions achieved by zero-emission vehicles no longer allow for averaging and backsliding by combustion vehicles with higher emissions.
- ***CARB must strengthen combustion vehicle emission standards and certifications to drive cleaner technologies and ensure real-world clean air benefits.*** We support CARB's goal of more stringent standards for criteria air pollutants and tighter certification and testing requirements, and call for CARB to consider more stringent levels than proposed in the workshop presentation.
 - ***CARB should set the combustion fleet smog-forming pollutant standard to a maximum of 0.02 grams per mile, if not lower, rather than flatlining the 0.03 grams per mile standard.*** During the September workshop, CARB noted continued work to evaluate reducing the fleet average to 0.02 grams for a larger portion of the fleet and should continue to pursue this approach.
 - ***CARB should strengthen the particle pollution standard measurement (US06) to ensure all vehicles meet the ACC particle pollution standard of 3 milligrams per mile and, ultimately, 1 mg/mile.*** We look forward to future workshops on this element of the program.
 - ***CARB should evaluate longer durability certification requirements for passenger cars*** to ensure vehicle emission controls remain functional for the duration of the vehicle's useful life.

- **We support CARB’s proposal to remove and phase out higher-emitting vehicle certification bins**, and to add lower-emitting certification levels to encourage further emission controls.
- **We support CARB’s proposal to eliminate the weighted average composite emissions testing certification option** that can lead to increased pollution in real-world driving conditions. As discussed at both workshops to date, CARB should end the practice of averaging test results that allows manufacturers to exceed pollution limits set by individual tests.
- **For Plug-In Hybrids (PHEVs), we support CARB’s research and proposals to address high-powered cold-start emissions** from PHEVs and support the development a new cold-start standard based on the best performing vehicles.
- **For medium-duty engines, we support updating and developing new certification standards to ensure “real-world” emissions benefits** during a range of driving conditions and look forward to CARB staff’s continued work on this proposal.

Accelerating the clean air and climate benefits of zero-emission vehicles

Our organizations strongly support Governor Newsom’s Executive Order to achieve 100 percent zero-emission vehicle sales in California by 2035. The improvements in air quality and reductions in climate pollution from this sector are critical to achieving health-protective clean air and climate standards. As with the provisions related to combustion vehicles, CARB’s ACC II ZEV rule must be focused on the deployment of real-world benefits and limit the use of crediting or other flexibilities that reduce real-world benefits of ZEVs.

- **We support CARB’s proposed credit system of a maximum of one credit per battery electric or fuel cell electric vehicle.** Previous crediting schemes that generated multiple credits per vehicles continue to undermine deployment of actual vehicles and the real-world benefits they would deliver.
 - **CARB should set the allowable time to use credits below the proposed five years** to advance real-world deployments of zero-emission vehicles in a more timely manner.
 - **CARB should separate and limit the use of historical ZEV credits** to ensure progress toward greater volumes of ZEV sales consistent with Executive Order N-79-20. Existing credit banks must not linger in the system in ways that weaken the signal for greater deployment of ZEVs. Both earlier retirement of credits and limiting application of historical (pre-2025) credits toward compliance are needed.
 - **We support CARB’s proposal to limit reliance on credits to 15 percent of compliance, but believe that this limit should gradually decline to zero percent in advance of the 100 percent ZEV sales.**
- **We support the ongoing efforts by CARB to develop consumer assurances within the ZEV program.** We appreciate CARB’s work to develop consumer protections and information in the form of warranties for drivetrain components and batteries, and battery “state of health” as important components of consumer acceptance.
- **CARB should consider models for fleet vehicle standards as a parallel rule to the ACC II program.** CARB’s recently adopted Clean Miles Standard for ride-hailing fleets could provide a useful model for other fleets (e.g., public fleets, delivery vehicles, rental fleets, etc.) to move more quickly to 100 percent ZEVs. CARB should evaluate fleet types and consider early action for fleets that might operate predominantly in highly-impacted communities.

- ***CARB should take a comprehensive approach to increasing access to zero emission technologies and health benefits in disadvantaged communities.***

Transportation pollution burdens fall most heavily on disadvantaged communities. We call on CARB to ensure that vehicle standards support the expansion of zero emission mobility options and clean air benefits in our most disadvantaged communities. Within the broader ZEV policy infrastructure, CARB should ensure that infrastructure investments and pilot projects, electric mobility options, consumer incentives and other strategies correct the disparities in pollution burdens and negative health outcomes.

Developing Future Greenhouse Gas Emission standards

In coordination with US EPA, CARB should develop and adopt the next round of vehicle standards as quickly as possible and ensure future standards recapture tons of emissions lost the delays, weakening and withdrawals of the prior federal administration. While no proposals have been offered to date, CARB should incorporate stronger standards for greenhouse gas emission reductions that align with achieving real-world benefits by cleaning up the combustion fleet and expanding deployment of zero-emission vehicles. Specifically, CARB should move forward with new greenhouse gas emission standards that generate real-world emission benefits, tighten program elements that could increase emissions or otherwise backslide, and to align the stringency of the program with achieving 100 percent zero-emission vehicle sales of passenger vehicles in California by 2035.

We appreciate your consideration of our comments and look forward to working with you as these critical standards are developed, adopted and implemented to benefit the health of all Californians.

Sincerely,

Catherine Dodd, PhD, RN, Policy Advisor
CA Alliance of Nurses for Healthy Environments

Jacques Corriveau, MD, FAAP
Chair, State Government Affairs Committee
American Academy of Pediatrics, California

Mark S. Noah, MD, FACP, President
American College of Physicians, California Services Chapter

Will Barrett, Director of Clean Air Advocacy
American Lung Association

Raj Dhillon, Manager of Advocacy & Public Policy
BREATHE California of Los Angeles County

Wayne A. Walls, MBA, RRT-ACCS, RRT-NPS, RCP, President
California Society for Respiratory Care

Vipul V. Jain, MD, MS, President
California Thoracic Society

Linda Rudolph, MD, MPH, Director
**Center for Climate Change and Health
Public Health Institute**

Kevin D. Hamilton, RRT, Executive Director
Central California Asthma Collaborative

Bill Magavern, Policy Director
Coalition for Clean Air

Rachelle Reyes Wenger, System Vice President, Public Policy & Advocacy Engagement
Dignity Health

Narc Carrel, President & CEO
Emphysema Foundation of America

Praveen Buddiga, MD, CEO
Family Allergy Asthma Clinic (Fresno)

Robyn Rothman, JD, Associate Director, State Policy Programs
Health Care Without Harm

Lynn Kersey, Executive Director
Maternal and Children Health Access (Los Angeles)

Harry Wang, MD, President
Physicians for Social Responsibility – Sacramento

Robert M. Gould, MD, President
San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility

Manal Aboelata, Deputy Executive Director
Prevention Institute

Joel Ervice, Associate Director
Regional Asthma Management and Prevention (RAMP)

Jim Mangia, MPH, President & CEO
St. John's Well Child and Family Center (Los Angeles)